

CAP Comment Summary Table

Com- ment #	Date	Name	Draft Page #	Final Page #	Comment	Staff Analysis			
						Action			Analysis
						<i>CAP Inclusion</i>	<i>Defer to CSC</i>	<i>Other Action</i>	
1	9/14/ 2009	Mayor Patterson	Global	Global	There needs to be some action to identify (which you have) data gaps in a chart, and to develop protocol and methods for gathering future data or revisiting data. This is an opportunity under partnership with businesses to collaborate.	X	X	X	A graphic illustration of the emissions inventory data inputs has been inserted into the CAP on page 5. Included with this is identification of data that was omitted but that should be considered in future inventories.
2	9/14/ 2009	Mayor Patterson	Global	Global	We need a timetable that is more definitive - set a range of dates by CSC for immediate (no regrets) action and then a range of dates and thresholds for the remainder of the strategies.		X		On 9/15/09, the City Council directed the Sustainability Commission to prioritize projects. Staff is preparing a set of recommendations for the Commission, with a cost analysis, timeline and anticipated GHG reductions.
3	9/14/ 2009	Mayor Patterson	Global	Global	We need a comprehensive list of all the recommended ordinances as well as policies.		X		A list of recommended ordinances, etc. will be included as part of the staff recommendation to the CSC when they are seated in early 2010.
4	9/14/ 2009	Mayor Patterson	Global	Global	The strategies need to be cross-linked. For instance, there are energy strategies that correspond to building strategies.	X			Graphic icons have been added to each strategy to link common themes between strategies. Themes include green building, solar energy, wind energy, energy efficiency, public outreach, water conservation

CAP Comment Summary Table

									and carbon sequestration. In addition, the revised summary table includes a comprehensive list of related strategies for each strategy.
5	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	Global	Global	Consider a graphic showing how 1 pound of CO2 "grows" to CO2EMT (what are the drivers and additives).	X			A graphic depicting the magnitude of various GHG's compared to CO2 has been included on page iii to demonstrate the significance of "equivalent metric tonnes."
6	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	Global	Global	Present to Solano County managers and county folks the idea of forming a cooperative arrangement like Sonoma County for an AB 811 property assessed clean energy program.			X	City staff is working with County Treasurer Chuck Lomeli, to establish the CaliforniaFIRST program in the City and County.
7	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	Global	Global	Add an outreach and technical assistance section to and for local businesses.		X		Technical assistance for businesses is fundamental in achieving GHG reductions in the Commercial and Industrial sector. Staff is forwarding this comment to the CSC in order to determine the most effective assistance and outreach methods.
8	8/27/2009	Kathy Kerridge	Global	Global	Would like the City to create an accounting and budgeting approach that demonstrates the dollars saved from investments into efficiency measures and upgrades recommended in the CAP. In doing so, a true cost analysis would emerge. Dollars that are saved through these measures should then be allocated back into CAP		X		For subsequent consideration by the Community Sustainability Commission.

CAP Comment Summary Table

					implementation, perhaps to pay for staff time.				
9	8/27/2009	Brian Harkins	Global	Global	Would like to see 'carbon tables' that show the inputs and outputs of the emissions inventory.	X			As stated in the analysis of Comment #1, a graphic illustration of the emissions inventory data inputs has been inserted into the CAP on page 5. Included with this is identification of data that was omitted but that should be considered in future inventories.
10	8/27/2009	Bob Berman	Global	Global	Would like assurance that an annual report is conducted and that the process loops back to the performance indicators/measures that are developed.	X			Principle 2 – Annual GHG Reduction Monitoring Report (p14), specifies that an annual monitoring report will be conducted and presented to the Community Sustainability Commission and the City Council on an annual basis.
11	8/27/2009 & 9/01/2009	Dana Dean	Global	Global	Please provide a list or index of all of the proposed activities (mandated or voluntary) for each of the following categories: private residences, commercial operations and industrial entities.			X	A summary table of strategies affecting residential, commercial and industrial sectors has been provided as an attachment to the 9/15/09 staff report, available online.
12	8/27/2009 & 9/01/2009	Dana Dean	Global	Global	Please cite to the record or provide references for additional information that is relied upon in the document, but not included in the document.			X	Staff has included a document titled 'Emissions Reduction Assumptions and Calculations' as an attachment to the staff report, available online as a standalone document. In addition, sources are footnoted with additional information available in the "References" chapter of the document, beginning on page 99.

CAP Comment Summary Table

13	9/01/2009	Gene Doherty	Global	Global	I also like the concept that Dana Dean offered, to align the Strategies into grids that target Residential, Commuter, Commercial, and Industrial sectors to define a “roadmap” for how they can implement appropriate actions specific to them. I would hope that once adopted, these could be laid out with the adopted timelines and become the basis for a great part of the public education and outreach that is critical to success.		X	X	Per Ms. Dean’s comment (#11), staff compiled a ‘CAP Strategy Overview Table by Sector’, which was included as Attachment D of the September 15, 2009 City Council staff report. The table categorized strategies into 3 groups: residential, commercial and industrial. In addition, the Climate Action Plan website has resources for the various sectors.
14	9/01/2009	Gene Doherty	iii	iii	Clarify the follow sentence: “Because GHGs absorb different amounts of heat, a common reference gas (CO2) is used to relate the amount of heat absorbed to the amount of the gas emissions, referred to as CO2 equivalent, and is the amount of GHGs emitted multiplied by its global warming potential.	X			Modified language: [Paragraph at bottom of page] <i>The global warming potential of a GHG is the potential of a gas or aerosol to trap heat in the atmosphere. Because GHGs absorb different amounts of heat, a common reference gas (CO2) is used to relate the amount of heat absorbed to the amount of the gas emissions, referred to as “CO2 equivalent,” and is the amount of GHGs emitted multiplied by its global warming potential.</i> <u>VARIOUS TYPES OF GHGS ABSORB DIFFERENT AMOUNTS OF HEAT; THEREFORE, A COMMON</u>

CAP Comment Summary Table

									<p><u>REFERENCE GAS. CO2. IS USED TO RELATE THE AMOUNT OF HEAT ABSORBED WITH THE AMOUNT OF GAS EMITTED. COMMONLY REFERRED TO AS "CO2 EQUIVALENT," OR, CO2E. CO2E IS CALCULATED BY MULTIPLYING THE AMOUNT OF GHGS EMITTED BY ITS GLOBAL WARMING POTENTIAL. A GRAPHIC DEPICTION IS LOCATED ON PAGE 5. In this report CO2 equivalent is measured in metric tonnes (CO2EMT). Carbon dioxide has a global warming potential of one. By contrast, methane (CH4) has a global warming potential of 21, meaning its global warming effect is 21 times greater than carbon dioxide on a molecule per molecule basis.</u></p>
15	9/01/2009	Gene Doherty	1	1	When self-referring to the document, it is written as "Draft Climate Action Plan". However, will the final document not be a Draft. Maybe string search and remove "Draft" from the document references.	X			Until adopted by Council on 9/15/09, the document was a draft and had to be referred to as such. Now that the document has been adopted, the language has been adjusted.

CAP Comment Summary Table

16	9/01/ 2009	Gene Doherty	7	9	Add BCDC's current projections of a 20 to 55 inch (1.6 to 4.5 feet) rise in sea level by 2100.	X			Modified language: Sea Level Rise: [second paragraph] <u>THE SAN FRANCISCO BAY CONSERVATION AND DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION (BCDC) HAS PROJECTED THE SEAL LEVEL IN THE SAN FRANCISCO BAY TO RISE 16 INCHES (1.3 FT) BY MID-CENTURY AND 55 INCHES (4.5 FT) BY 2100 (SEE IMAGE NEXT PAGE).</u> A rise in sea level may have a significant impact on our built environment including underground infrastructure, shoreline development, and structures built on fill materials.
17	8/27/ 2009	Don Dean (PC)	7	10	Enlarge image provided by BCDC illustrating the potential effects of sea level rise on Benicia.	X			The BCDC image has been enlarged to a full page.
18	9/14/ 2009	Mayor Patterson	8	11	Public Health, add comparison to the state (reference could be anything). It is clarified later on in the document.	X			Add/modify language: Public Health header: [first sentence] <u>ACCORDING TO THE CALIFORNIA CLIMATE CHANGE CENTER'S JULY 2006 REPORT, OUR CHANGING CLIMATE: ASSESSING THE RISKS TO CALIFORNIA,</u> warmer temperatures and changes in precipitation have serious public health implications

CAP Comment Summary Table

									[new last sentence] <u>THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA IS ALSO WORKING TO ESTABLISH PUBLIC HEALTH ADAPTATION STRATEGIES TO ADDRESS THE POTENTIAL IMPACTS OF CLIMATE CHANGE ON PUBLIC HEALTH..</u>
19	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	10	13	Clarify PURE recommended that the remaining 14 million be redirected for Valero good will in the original settlement.	X			The \$14 million concept was incorporated into the 2008 Settlement Agreement, which is referenced in the Climate Action Plan.
20	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	10	14	Add Good Neighbor Steering Committee and describe briefly.	X			Add/modify language: Local Action [Sentence #6] <i>...In doing so, a settlement agreement was reached between Valero Refinery, City of Benicia, and the Good Neighbor Steering Committee (GNSC); GNSC is the refinery's citizen oversight committee.</i> <u>GNSC IS AN UNINCORPORATED ASSOCIATION OF BENICIA RESIDENTS AND BUSINESS OWNERS WHO ARE CONCERNED ABOUT POTENTIAL ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS OF BENICIA REFINERY OPERATIONS GENERALLY AND THE VIP AND ITS AMENDMENTS</u>

CAP Comment Summary Table

									<i><u>SPECIFICALLY...</u> The terms of the \$14 million settlement agreement were...</i>
21	9/01/2009	Gene Doherty	10	14	Local Action: GNSC is NOT the refinery's citizen oversight committee, that role is held by the Valero Community Advisory Panel. Could we honor the GNSC in a better way within this section?	X			Please see comment #20.
22	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	13	15	Principle 1 - Add "liaison to CSC."	X			Add/modify language: Principle 1 [last sentence] <i><u>IN ADDITION, THE GROUP WILL PROVIDE STAFF SUPPORT TO THE COMMUNITY SUSTAINABILITY COMMISSION.</u></i>
23	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	14	15	Principle 2 - Add "adaptive management principle" and explain: Need to monitor indicators and make adjustments as appropriate, including new strategies, standards, etc.	X			Add/modify language: Principle 2 [second sentence] <i>Tracking the indicators associated with implemented strategies yearly does this most effectively. <u>TRACKING STRATEGY INDICATORS/PERFORMANCE MEASURES IN ORDER TO IMPLEMENT ADAPTIVE MANAGEMENT PRINCIPLES IS THE MOST EFFECTIVE APPROACH. IN DOING SO, STRATEGIES AND STANDARDS MAY BE MODIFIED OR ADDED IN ORDER TO BEST MEET THE DETERMINED NEEDS.</u> The</i>

CAP Comment Summary Table

									<i>findings of the annual analysis should be presented to the Community Sustainability Commission and to the City Council.</i>
24	8/27/2009	Mayor Patterson	14	16	Existing Actions - might want to in a general reference indicate City is pursuing Department of Conservation Emerald City partnership and short description of program (this is far more certain that the train or ferry idea).	X			Add language: Emission Reduction Focus Areas – Principle 3, GHG Reductions in Industrial and Commercial Sector [Add new paragraph to Principle 3, after the existing verbiage] <u><i>CITY STAFF HAS INITIATED PRELIMINARY DISCUSSIONS WITH THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF CONSERVATION REGARDING THE EMERALD CITIES PARTNERSHIP PROGRAM. THE PROGRAM IS A PUBLIC-PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP DESIGNED TO ACHIEVE CALIFORNIA'S RESOURCE CONSERVATION AND ENVIRONMENTAL GOALS THROUGH TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE. THE PROGRAM HAS THE POTENTIAL TO PROVIDE THE BUSINESS COMMUNITY WITH COST FREE TECHNICAL RESOURCES.</i></u>
25	9/01/2009	Gene Doherty	19	21	Education + Public Outreach - Introduction, add bolded words: Education and outreach are critical components of climate protection	X			Add/modify language: Education + Public Outreach - <i>Education and outreach are critical components of climate</i>

CAP Comment Summary Table

					planning because of the changes in citizen behavior <u>AND BUSINESS PRACTICES</u> that will be needed in order to meet the City’s emission reduction targets.				<i>protection planning because of the changes in citizen behavior <u>AND BUSINESS PRACTICES</u> that will be needed in order to meet the City’s emission reduction targets.</i>
26	9/01/2009	Gene Doherty	19	21	Education + Public Outreach – Existing Actions, add proper name: The seminars use the expertise of the Master Gardeners and <u>CALIFORNIA</u> Native Plant Society to provide ...	X			Modify language: Existing Actions: [first paragraph] <i>The seminars use the expertise of the Master Gardeners and <u>CALIFORNIA</u> Native Plant Society to provide instruction on topics such as water wise design and irrigation.</i>
27	8/27/2009	Kathy Kerridge	19	21	Would like to see language in the Education and Public Outreach focus area that raises community awareness on the subject of food consumption patterns, production and distribution.	X			Modify language: EO-1.1 [First sentence] <i>An interactive, informational website could be regularly maintained to include tools and resources about <u>FOOD SUPPLY</u>, green building technology...</i> EO-1.3 [Second sentence] <i>...Topics may include renewable energy and energy efficiency; water efficient landscaping; community composting; <u>FOOD CONSUMPTION, PRODUCTION AND DISTRIBUTION</u>;...</i> EO-1.4 [add 3 rd theme]

CAP Comment Summary Table

									<u>LOCALLY SOURCED FOOD: PROVIDE COMMUNITY RESOURCES THAT EDUCATE THE PUBLIC ON THE IMPORTANCE OF LOCALLY GROWN FOOD, LOW MERCURY FISH, ORGANIC PRODUCE, AND NON-PROCESSED FOODS, AMONG OTHER THINGS.</u>
28	8/27/ 2009	Brian Harkins	19	21	Would like to see a major effort in educating the community regarding climate change science.	X			Add/modify language: EO-1.1 [First sentence] <i>An interactive, informational website could be regularly maintained to include tools and resources about, <u>CLIMATE CHANGE SCIENCE</u>, food supply, green building technology...</i> EO-1.3 [Second sentence] <i>...Topics may include <u>CLIMATE CHANGE SCIENCE</u>; renewable energy and energy efficiency; water efficient landscaping; community composting; food consumption, production and distribution;...</i>
29	9/01/ 2009	Gene Doherty	20	22	Organize and host a twice annual educational workshop series, possibly associated with Earth Day in the spring and Climate Action Day in the fall.	X		X	Add/Modify language: EO-1.3: <i>Organize and host an annual educational workshop series, <u>AT LEAST ONCE PER YEAR, POTENTIALLY ASSOCIATED WITH EARTH DAY IN THE SPRING AND INTERNATIONAL CLIMATE</u></i>

CAP Comment Summary Table

									<u><i>ACTION DAY IN THE FALL.</i></u>
30	9/01/2009	Gene Doherty	21	23	Strategy EO-1.7 Implementation Action: Purchase, or encourage donations of , initial book collection; Implement ongoing green book purchasing and donation program.	X			Add/modify language: EO-1.7 [Implementation Actions 2&3] -Purchase <u><i>OR ENCOURAGE DONATIONS OF GREEN</i></u> book collection. - Implement ongoing green book purchasing <u><i>AND DONATION</i></u> program
31	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	21	23	Strategy EO-1.8: Add kiosk at new Bridge bike and pedestrian path.		X		For subsequent consideration by the Community Sustainability Commission.
32	8/27/2009	Dan Healy (PC)	21	24	Add language encouraging the use of Channel 27 as a community sustainability resource.	X			Add new Strategy EO-1.9: [New strategy] <u><i>EO-1.9: UTILIZE PUBLIC ACCESS TELEVISION: IDENTIFY AND DEVELOP APPROPRIATE CONTENT TO BE AIRED ON CHANNEL 27, BENICIA'S PUBLIC ACCESS TELEVISION STATION.</i></u> [New implementation actions] <u><i>-IDENTIFY APPROPRIATE CONTENT:</i></u> <u><i>-COORDINATE WITH TELEVISION STATION.</i></u>
33	9/14/2009	Dan Healy (PC)	21	24	Add language encouraging partnerships with local labor groups for green workforce development.	X			Add new Strategy: EO-1.10 [New strategy] <u><i>STRATEGY EO-1.10: COMMUNITY PARTNERSHIPS FOR GREEN WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT -- DEVELOP PARTNERSHIPS</i></u>

CAP Comment Summary Table

								<p><u>WITH COMMUNITY STAKEHOLDERS SUCH AS THE BENICIA UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT, PG & E, AND LOCAL LABOR GROUPS TO ENCOURAGE GREEN WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT.</u></p> <p>[New implementation actions] <u>-IDENTIFY APPROPRIATE PARTNERSHIP OPPORTUNITIES;</u> <u>-INITIATE DIALOGUE WITH STAKEHOLDER GROUPS;</u> <u>-DEVELOP GREEN WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMS.</u></p>
34	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	21	24	Design a large weatherproof City of Benicia GHG emissions reduction goal thermometer (along with global temperature).	X		<p>Add new Strategy EO-1.11: [New strategy] <u>EO-1.11 EMISSION REDUCTION THERMOMETER:</u> <u>DESIGN AND CONSTRUCT A LARGE-SCALE OUTDOOR 'THERMOMETER' TO BE INSTALLED AT A HIGHLY VISIBLE CITY-OWNED LOCATION AS A VISUAL DEMONSTRATION OF CITY AND COMMUNITY PROGRESS TOWARD MEETING THE 2020 REDUCTION TARGETS.</u></p> <p>[New implementation actions]</p>

CAP Comment Summary Table

									<u>-DESIGN AND CONSTRUCT GHG 'THERMOMETER'</u> <u>-DETERMINE APPROPRIATE LOCATION AND INSTALL ACCORDINGLY</u> <u>-TIE INTO A LARGER EDUCATION AND OUTREACH MARKETING CAMPAIGN.</u>
35	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	22	24	Consider adding Healthy communities goals of general plan and link to BUSD		X	X	This comment is addressed in concept in the resolution adopting the Climate Action Plan. This comment will be forwarded to Community Sustainability Commission for further consideration.
36	9/01/2009	Gene Doherty	22	24 [now EO-1.15]	Strategy EO-1.12 Add Implementation Action: "Have the Police Department sponsor regular "Bike Safety" events for kids, continue the "Safe Routes to School" program, and develop a "Safe Routes to Commute" program for adults."	X			Add/modify language: EO-1.12 [Implementation Action #4 &5] <u>-SPONSOR REGULAR "BIKE SAFETY" EVENTS FOR CHILDREN.</u> <u>-CONTINUE THE "SAFE ROUTES TO SCHOOL" PROGRAM.</u>
37	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	27	31	Strategy E-2.2: Add "commercial" to property owners (in other words, private residential, commercial and industrial).	X			Add/modify language: E-2.2 [1 st sentence] <i>Similar to the Berkeley</i> <u>FIRST RESIDENTIAL, COMMERCIAL AND INDUSTRIAL</u> <i> property owners to install ...</i>
38	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	27	31	Set goal for city buildings and facilities with budget link.		X		For subsequent consideration by the Community Sustainability Commission.

CAP Comment Summary Table

39	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	28	32	Strategy E-2.5: - After "renewable energy sites", add "such as building rooftops, parking and vacant lots."	X		Add/modify language: E-2.5 [1 st sentence] <i>Develop a citywide database identifying potential renewable energy sites, <u>SUCH AS BUILDING ROOFTOPS, PARKING AND VACANT LOTS...</u></i>
40	9/01/2009	Gene Doherty	28	32	Strategy E-2.5, add words: "Develop a citywide database identifying existing and potential renewable energy sites."	X		Add/modify language: E-2.5 [1 st sentence] <i>Develop a citywide database identifying EXISTING AND potential renewable energy sites ...</i>
41	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	28	32	Strategy E-2.6: add implementation action after "consider partnership opportunities:" "Initiate discussion by city managers and county 4Cs."	X		Add/modify language: E-2.6 [Implementation Actions 3&4] <i>-Consider partnership opportunities <u>WITH SOLANO COUNTY MUNICIPALITIES AND PUBLIC AGENICIES;</u></i> <i><u>-INITIATE CONVERSATION WITH SENIOR MANAGEMENT AND DECISION MAKERS IN NEIGHBORING JURISDICTIONS.</u></i>
42	9/01/2009	Gene Doherty	29	33	Strategy E-3.1 Add Implementation Action: "Develop marketing materials of benefits to parking lot owners that include the energy and emissions savings of reduce air conditioning usage of shaded cars versus heated cars."	X		Add/modify language: E-3.1 [Implementation Action #3] <i>- <u>DEVELOP MARKETING MATERIALS PROMOTING BENEFITS OF PARKING LOT SOLAR PV ARRAYS TO PROPERTY OWNERS.</u></i>

CAP Comment Summary Table

43	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	29	33	Strategy E-3.2 If the AB 811 program is in place, why would the fees need to be waived? Maybe there could be a modification to E-3.2 which recognizes the different financing programs, hardship issue, affordable housing, etc. Indeed, consider sequestering fees in a special account which provides long term funding for future audit programs, etc.		X		For subsequent consideration by the Community Sustainability Commission.
44	9/01/2009	Gene Doherty	29	33	Strategy E-3.2: Implementation Action, add words: “Educate the public regarding the new program and the need to secure panels and equipment from theft. ”	X			The comment is best incorporated into the Solar Energy header under Objective E-3. Add/modify language: Objective E-3 [Last sentence before ‘Existing Actions’] <u>IN EACH CASE, IT IS ESSENTIAL THAT PROPERTY OWNERS BE EDUCATED ON THE NEED TO SECURE PANELS AND RELATED EQUIPMENT FROM THEFT.</u>
45	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	29	34	Strategy E-3.3 Implementation actions, add weekly or more often electronic news items. The Alert system merely tells the recipient that there is new news.	X			This comment is best addressed in Strategy EO-1.1, Update and Maintain Sustainable Development Website Add/modify language: EO-1.1 [Implementation Action #1] <u>-INCORPORATE AN EMAIL ALERT SYSTEM THAT AUTOMATICALLY GENERATES WEEKLY OR</u>

CAP Comment Summary Table

									<u>MONTHLY UPDATES FOR THE PUBLIC ON RECENT WEBSITE ADDITIONS/NEWS ITEMS:</u>
46	9/01/2009	Gene Doherty	29	34	Strategy E-3.3: Implementation Action, add words: Develop education outreach campaign, especially targeted to solar installation contractors , for existing incentive programs, including the CSI.	X			Add/modify language: E-3.3 [Implementation Action #1] - <i>Develop education and outreach campaign, <u>TARGETTED TO SOLAR INSTALLATION CONTRACTORS, RESIDENTS, AND BUSINESS OWNERS</u> for existing incentive programs, including the CSI.</i>
47	9/01/2009	Gene Doherty	29	34	Wind Energy: With recently learned knowledge, I would recommend that we don't stipulate "vertical axis" wind turbines to any degree. Apparently they are not ready for prime time yet, though hopefully they will be soon.			X	See analysis and language modification below (Comment #47).
48	8/27/2009	Reg Page	29	34	Objective E-4 – Increase Amount of Wind Energy Production in Benicia to 15% of Citywide Usage by 2020 (pp29-30): On p29, reword the last sentence to read: "New vertical axis wind turbines should be included as potential alternatives to traditional bladed turbines."	X			Add/modify language: Object. E-4 [last sentence] <i>New vertical axis wind turbines are affordable, aesthetically pleasing, and pose little threat to the avian population but are not yet practical for more than residential usage.</i> <u>NEW VERTICAL AXIS WIND TURBINES SHOULD BE INCLUDED AS POTENTIAL ALTERNATIVES TO TRADITIONAL HORIZONTAL AXIS TURBINES.</u>

CAP Comment Summary Table

49	8/27/ 2009	Reg Page	29	34	Redefine the Objective's goal of a 15% increase of wind energy production to be limited to City Government operations, rather than City-wide.			X	Benicia's considerable wind resources are ideal for wind power generation. Therefore, this objective should not be limited to city operations, but rather set a high goal for the entire community.
50	8/27/ 2009	Reg Page	30	34	Strategy E-4.1 – Increase Amount of Wind Energy Production in Benicia to 15% of Citywide Usage by 2020 (pp29-30): On p30, reword Implementation Action 1 to read: "Sponsor community workshops to educate the community about wind energy collection technology."	X			Modify language: E-4.1 [Implementation Action #1] <i>Sponsor community workshops to promote and educate the community about wind energy collection technology</i>
51	8/27/ 2009	Reg Page	30	34	Strategy E-4.1 – Implementation Action 3: Delete due to redundancy and reference to residential usage.	X			Design guidelines are distinctly different than an overlay zone. Therefore, Implementation Action #3 is important to include, with a modification to address Mr. Page's concern regarding an inference to wind in residential districts. Add/modify language: E-4.1 [Implementation Action #3] <i>Develop design guidelines specifying the allowed size, height, and maximum noise thresholds of wind collection systems in residential, commercial and industrial land use areas. <u>APPROPRIATE ZONING DESIGNATIONS.</u></i>

CAP Comment Summary Table

52	9/01/2009	Gene Doherty	31	35	Strategy E-5.1 Add Implementation Action: Have the Community Sustainability Commission monitor for research and new technology that could make tidal power an economically viable option.		X		For subsequent consideration by the Community Sustainability Commission.
53	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	31	35	Replace Strategy E-5.2- Geothermal Energy Procurement with the Sonoma example of wastewater treatment being used for heating and cooling through deep ground piping. This is doable now and does not require the same kind of investment as geothermal.		X		For subsequent consideration by the Community Sustainability Commission.
54	9/01/2009	Gene Doherty	31	36	Strategy E-6.1 Add Implementation Action: Develop a citywide database, in conjunction with E-2.5, that can identify potential first adopters of battery storage facilities.		X		For subsequent consideration by the Community Sustainability Commission.
55	8/27/2009	Brian Harkins	35	39	Would like the emissions inventory report and the CAP to address commute travel of by Benicia residents outside of the city.		X		The models used by staff in 2008 were the standard at the time and did not include the capability of calculating commute traffic outside of City limits. Staff contacted the Solano Transportation Authority in an attempt to get regional commute data in order to make our own assumptions, however, the data is not available at this time. Staff recommends including this data in the follow-up inventory scheduled for 2011/2012.

CAP Comment Summary Table

56	9/14/ 2009	Mayor Patterson	35	39	Add to Transportation Table & Summary Table: School buses and Safe Routes to School (link with Healthy Communities).	X			Bussing has been added as a new strategy (T-4.2) and is included in the summary tables. Safe Routes to School is an existing program that's continued success has been included as an Implementation Action for Strategy EO-1.12.
57	9/14/ 2009	Mayor Patterson	36	40	Adaptation, add discussion of local flooding (will not drain as fast with sea level rise) and river flooding (Sacramento and San Joaquin during a severe storm will have about a 20 foot head meeting sea surge. Flooding is both sea level rise, increased river flooding and runoff.	X			Add/modify language: Transportation and Land Use Focus Area – Adaptation section [First Sentence] <i>As <u>THE</u> sea level rises, erosion will occur more frequently with more severity, threatening low-lying coastal structures and transportation infrastructure. <u>IN ADDITION, SEA LEVEL RISE MAY RESULT IN INCREASED RIVER FLOODING (SACRAMENTO AND SAN JOAQUIN WATERWAYS) AND RUNOFF DUE TO ITS NEGATIVE IMPACT ON THE DRAINAGE RATE OF WATER.</u></i>
58	9/14/ 2009	Mayor Patterson	37	40	Strategy T-1.2: Add Implementation Actions verbiage: purchase weather protected racks (e.g. Oregon example).	X			Add/modify language: T-1.2 [Implementation Action #2] <u>-PURCHASE WEATHER PROTECTED bicycle storage RACKS at municipal buildings and facilities.</u>
59	9/01/ 2009	Gene Doherty	38	42	Strategy T-2.4: Implementation Action, add words: Traffic signal, and uphill stop sign , assessment	X			Add/modify language: T-2.4 [Modify title of strategy] Strategy T-2.4: Traffic Signal

CAP Comment Summary Table

					study				<p><u>AND STOP SIGN Optimization</u></p> <p>[First sentence] Synchronize traffic signals and implement LIMIT UPHILL STOP SIGNS.</p> <p>[Implementation Action #1] -Traffic signal <u>AND UPHILL STOP SIGN</u> assessment study;</p>
60	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	38	40	Existing Actions, middle of paragraph, the pedestrian and bike bath are completed so this should be updated.	X			<p>Add/modify language: Objective T-3, Existing Actions [Add new sentence #3]</p> <p><i>...The Benicia General Plan includes policies and programs to create a comprehensive circulation system of pedestrian and bicycle routes. <u>RECENT SUCCESSES INCLUDE DEVELOPMENT OF A BICYCLE AND PEDESTRIAN LANE ON THE BENICIA/MARTINEZ BRIDGE.</u></i></p> <p>[Sentence #5] <i>...This includes <u>PARTNERING WITH THE SOLANO TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY (STA) AND CALTRANS TO connectng</u> residential and commercial districts to the bicycle and pedestrian trails at the Benicia</i></p>

CAP Comment Summary Table

									<p><i>State Park, working with Caltrans to develop a bicycle and pedestrian lane on the Benicia/Martinez Bridge, continuing to expand</i></p> <p><u>CONTINUE EXPANSION OF the Bay Trail, and building curb extensions and narrowing street crossing widths at major intersections.</u></p>
61	9/15/2009	Solano Transportation Authority (STA)	38	42	It would also be appropriate to note that STA has an adopted Countywide Bicycle Master Plan and Countywide Pedestrian Master Plan, including facilities in and connections to Benicia.	X			<p>Add/modify language: Objective T-3 [Existing Actions, new last paragraph]</p> <p><u>THE SOLANO TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY HAS AN ADOPTED COUNTYWIDE BICYCLE MASTER PLAN AND COUNTYWIDE PEDESTRIAN MASTER PLAN, INCLUDING FACILITIES IN AND CONNECTIONS TO BENICIA.</u></p>
62	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	38	43	Strategy T-3.1: Add - COQ, Camel Barn; Implementation Actions, insert after "sized and weather protected bicycle racks".	X			<p>Add/modify language: T-3.1 [First sentence]</p> <p><i>Adding bicycle racks at City facilities, including City Hall, the Gymnasium, the Clocktower, <u>COMMANDING OFFICER'S QUARTERS, CAMEL BARN</u>, and City parks promotes bicycle ridership...</i></p> <p>[Implementation Action #2] <i>-Install appropriately sized <u>AND WEATHER PROTECTED</u> bicycle racks...</i></p>

CAP Comment Summary Table

63	9/01/2009	Gene Doherty	38	43	Strategy T-3.1: Implementation Action, correct word: Identify appropriate locations at individual City-owned facilities for bicycle racks.	X			Add/modify language: T-3.1 [Implementation Action #1] <i>-Identify appropriate locations at individual City-owned cities <u>FACILITIES</u> for bicycle racks.</i>
64	9/15/2009	Solano Transportation Authority (STA)	38	43	There is a discussion of Alternative Transportation - Bicycle + Pedestrian, Existing Actions. STA has been an active partner with the City of Benicia and Caltrans to plan and deliver projects such as the State Park Road/Rose Drive overcrossing, the Benicia/Martinez bridge bike/ped lane and the local connections to the bridge, and the Safe Routes to School program. It would be appropriate to list STA as well as Caltrans as a partner in these projects.	X			This comment is addressed in the staff response to Comment #59.
65	9/01/2009	Gene Doherty	39	43	Strategy T-3.2: Implementation Action, add words: ... Infrastructure may include bicycle racks and storage and dedicated bicycle lanes.	X			Add/modify language: T-3.2 [Implementation Action, sentence #2] <i>...Infrastructure may include bicycle <u>RACKS AND</u> storage, and dedicated bicycle lanes.</i>
66	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	39	43	Strategy T-3.4: add Complete Street Plan for: bicycle, pedestrian, etc. (See CalTrans and other model programs). In fact there is a new program for complete streets that is based on a LEED approach with point system and so forth.				Add/modify language: T-3.4 [First sentence] <i>A bicycle and pedestrian plan, <u>INCLUDING A 'COMPLETE STREET' PROGRAM, WOULD BE COMPRISED OF</u> delineates an integrated network of trails, sidewalks and bicycle paths;...</i> [Implementation Action #2]

CAP Comment Summary Table

									<i>Develop a comprehensive bicycle and pedestrian master plan, <u>INCLUDING A 'COMPLETE STREET' PROGRAM</u>, with actions to increase safety...</i>
67	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	40	44	Objective T-4: "In 2009, the City initiated the Benicia..." modify to focus on concept but not locations.	X			Add/modify language: Objective T4 [Existing Actions, last paragraph] <i>In 2009, the City initiated the Benicia Intermodal Facilities Project, located at Military West/Southampton Road and Military/First, which will TO serve the new regional route 78 that provides service between the Vallejo Ferry Terminal and Walnut Creek BART. The project will integrate vital improvements that reduce vehicle miles travelled (VMT) and enhance pedestrian safety, while providing Park-and-Ride facilities for the ridership of the regional route 78 line <u>AND THE REGIONAL ROUTE 40 LINE (FOR I-680 CONNECTION).</u></i>
68	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	40	45	Strategy T-4.1: Add to last bullet at Establish a program, "or subsidize costs"; add public bicycles and cars (cross-link with recommendation in other section).	X			Add/modify language: T-4.1 [Implementation Action #3] <i>-Establish a program <u>OR SUBSIDIZE COSTS</u> for businesses to provide transit passes for employees.</i>

CAP Comment Summary Table

69	9/14/ 2009	Mayor Patterson	40	45	Strategy T-4.1: Add connection with Regional Route 40 for I-680 connection.	X			This comment is addressed in the staff response to Comment #67.
70	8/27/ 2009	Rod Sherry (PC)	40	45	Strategy Add a strategy encouraging the Benicia Unified School District to reintroduce bussing before and after school.	X			<p>Add/modify language: Objective T-4 to read: <i>Increase <u>PUBLIC TRANSIT Ridership 10% by 2020</u></i></p> <p>Add New Strategy: T-4.2: [New strategy] <u>STRATEGY T-4.2:</u> <u>ENCOURAGE BUSD TO REINSTATE SCHOOL BUSES MORNING AND AFTERNOON TRAFFIC PATTERS AS THEY RELATE TO SCHOOL DROP-OFF/PICK-UP HAVE A SIGNIFICANT IMPACT ON TRANSPORTATION RELATED GHG EMISSIONS. REINSTATING A BENICIA UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT BUS PROGRAM WITH CLEAN FUEL VEHICLES WOULD SIGNIFICANTLY DECREASE COMMUNITYWIDE EMISSIONS AND ALLEVIATE CONCENTRATED TRAFFIC CONGESTION.</u></p> <p>[New Implementation Action] <u>-ENGAGE THE BENICIA UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT TO PERFORM A FEASIBILITY STUDY ON RE-ESTABLISHMENT OF</u></p>

CAP Comment Summary Table

									<u>SCHOOL BUSSING PROGRAM;</u> <u>-IDENTIFY FUNDING SOURCES.</u>
71	9/01/2009	Gene Doherty	40	45	Transportation + Land Use I agree with Commissioner Sherry that an Objective/Strategy should be added to Reduce Vehicle Emissions associated with “school” drop of and pick ups. For this Strategy, add an Implementation Action for it: Encourage the development and implementation of a “Walking School Bus” program. http://www.walkingschoolbus.org/	X			Add/modify language: T-4.2 [Implementation Actions #1] <u>- ENCOURAGE THE DEVELOPMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION OF A “WALKING SCHOOL BUS” PROGRAM.</u> http://www.walkingschoolbus.org
72	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	41	46	Strategy T-6.1: Add action to have Ferry added by STA to capital projects (without regional sponsor, Ferry does not get support from WETA or MTC).	X			Add/modify language: T-6.1 [New Implementation Action #1] <u>-WORK WITH SOLANO TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY TO ADD FERRY INFRASTRUCTURE TO THEIR LIST OF CAPITAL PROJECTS.</u>
73	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	41	46	Strategy T-6.1: Add Implementation Action: Have the Community Sustainability Commission monitor the actions of WETA regarding their feasibility study for the Antioch and Martinez ferry terminal locations which might make a ferry or water taxi in Benicia an economically viable option. (Note, that on 6/28/2009, WETA adopted their Management Plan that only recommends funding a feasibility study for Antioch and	X	X		Add/modify language: T-6.1 [New Implementation Action #2] <u>-MONITOR THE ACTIONS OF WETA REGARDING A FEASIBILITY STUDY FOR THE ANTIOCH AND MARTINEZ FERRY TERMINAL LOCATIONS.</u>

CAP Comment Summary Table

					Martinez locations for sometime during the next 5 years, Benicia is not even listed as a notable option for any action within the next 10 years. It is highly unlikely that State or Federal funds will become available except through WETA, so this will require significant political sway to address this in any short term period.)				
74	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	41	46	Strategy T-6.2: Existing studies identified the probability of train ridership (see Short Range Travel studies). This is a long-range issue that is complicated by the existing rail alignment being in the marsh subject to SLR. More immediate success would be comprehensive inter and intra city transit.		X		For subsequent consideration by the Community Sustainability Commission.
75	9/01/2009	Gene Doherty	41	46	Strategy T-6.2: Add Implementation Action: Have the Community Sustainability Commission monitor the actions of the Solano Transportation Authority regarding implementation actions or changes to the Auburn – Oakland Regional Rail Study or other studies and plans.	X			Add/modify language: T-6.2 [New Implementation Action #1] <i><u>-MONITOR THE ACTIONS OF THE SOLANO TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY REGARDING IMPLEMENTATION ACTIONS OR CHANGES TO THE AUBURN-OAKLAND REGIONAL RAIL STUDY, AND OTHER APPLICABLE STUDIES/PLANS.</u></i>
76	9/15/2009	Solano Transportation Authority (STA)	42	46	Under the discussion of Travel Demand Management - Existing Actions, please add the following paragraph:	X			Add/modify language: Objective T-7 [Existing Actions, New 2 nd paragraph] <i><u>THE SOLANO</u></i>

CAP Comment Summary Table

				<p>"The Solano Transportation Authority (STA) offers free services and information for alternative transportation in Solano County and surrounding regions through the Solano Napa Commuter Information (SNCI) program. Carpool, vanpool, bus, ferry, rail, and bicycling information and services are delivered to the general public and through employers. SNCI is a part of the Bay Area regional 511 program and uses the regional ridematching system to provide free carpool/vanpool matchlists for commuters. The new ridematching system, implemented in May 2009, has the capability to display a site that can be customized with the identity of a local jurisdiction or employer using logos, colors and other design features - but still have the advantages of a large regional database. The City of Benicia, its residents and employees have full access to this program."</p>				<p><u>TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY OFFERS FREE SERVICES AND INFORMATION FOR ALTERNATIVE TRANSPORTATION IN SOLANO COUNTY AND SURROUNDING REGIONS THROUGH THE SOLANO NAPA COMMUTER INFORMATION (SNCI) PROGRAM. CARPOOL, VANPOOL, BUS, FERRY, RAIL, AND BICYCLING INFORMATION AND SERVICES ARE DELIVERED TO THE GENERAL PUBLIC AND THROUGH EMPLOYERS. SNCI IS A PART OF THE BAY AREA REGIONAL 511 PROGRAM AND USES THE REGIONAL RIDEMATCHING SYSTEM TO PROVIDE FREE CARPOOL/VANPOOL MATCHLISTS FOR COMMUTERS. THE NEW RIDEMATCHING SYSTEM, IMPLEMENTED IN MAY 2009, HAS THE CAPABILITY TO DISPLAY A WEBSITE THAT CAN BE CUSTOMIZED WITH THE IDENTITY OF A LOCAL JURISDICTION OR EMPLOYER USING LOGOS, COLORS AND OTHER DESIGN FEATURES – BUT</u></p>
--	--	--	--	---	--	--	--	---

CAP Comment Summary Table

								<u>STILL HAVE THE ADVANTAGES OF A LARGE REGIONAL DATABASE.</u>
77	9/14/2009	Solano Transportation Authority (STA)	42	47	<p>Strategy T-7.1: Carpool Program, Rather than having the City of Benicia create a local carpool program, it would be more effective to work to increase the awareness and participation of Benicia residents and employees in the Solano Napa Commuter Information (SNCI) program. I know that SNCI staff, specifically Program Manager Judy Leaks, would be happy to work with you on website connections and other public outreach to customize a program for Benicia.</p> <p>I would recommend the following additional changes to the plan:</p> <p>"Strategy T-7.1 Carpool Program "Additional participation in the SNCI regional rideshare program would further connect Benicia residents and workforce with carpool partners. This would further facilitate carpooling, as well as other alternative modes and transit use, for residents coming into and out of the area, thus reducing emissions by removing automobiles from the roads and highways."</p> <p>"Implementing Action "Work with SNCI to provide public</p>	X		<p>Add/modify language: T-7.1 [Insert new 2nd paragraph to Strategy T-7.1] <u>ADDITIONAL PARTICIPATION IN THE SOLANO NAPA COMMUTER INFORMATION (SNCI) REGIONAL RIDESHARE PROGRAM WOULD CONNECT BENICIA RESIDENTS AND WORKFORCE WITH CARPOOL PARTNERS. THIS WOULD FACILITATE CARPOOLING, AS WELL AS OTHER ALTERNATIVE MODES OF TRANSIT USE, FOR RESIDENTS COMING INTO AND OUT OF THE AREA..</u></p> <p>Add/modify language: T-7.1 Implementation Action #1] Develop an online carpool information and communication website and an education program to maximize website usage. <u>WORK WITH SNCI TO PROVIDE PUBLIC EDUCATION AND ENHANCE ACCESS FOR BENICIA RESIDENTS, EMPLOYERS AND THEIR EMPLOYEES TO SNCI RIDEMATCHING AND</u></p>

CAP Comment Summary Table

					education and enhance access for Benicia residents, employers and their employees to SNCI ridematching and related services. Provide a direct connection to SNCI services on the City of Benicia web page."				<u>RELATED SERVICES. PROVIDE A DIRECT CONNECTION TO SNCI SERVICES ON THE CITY OF BENICIA WEB PAGE.</u>
78	9/15/2009	Mayor Patterson	42	47	Strategy T-7.2: Implementation, add: provide incentives to live in Benicia.	X			Add/modify language: T-7.2 [New Implementation Action #2] <u>-PROVIDE INCENTIVES FOR CITY EMPLOYEES TO LIVE IN BENICIA.</u>
79	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	42	48	Strategy T-8.2: insert after Car, "bicycle" [share program].		X		For subsequent consideration by the Community Sustainability Commission.
80	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	43	48	Existing Actions, use global insert "watersheds" with any reference to agriculture or open space.	X			Suggested language additions have been made throughout the document.
81	9/15/2009	Mayor Patterson	43	48	Strategy T-8.3: at Implementation add: one-stop park program.	X			Add/modify language: T-8.3 [New Implementation Action #2] <u>-CONDUCT A FEASIBILITY ANALYSIS FOR A 'ONE-STOP' PARKING MANAGEMENT PROGRAM: IMPLEMENT APPROPRIATE MEASURES.</u>
82	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	43	48	Strategy T-8.3: Implementation Action, add words: Conduct a commuting and parking study of local businesses and developments to assess the usage of existing parking lots, and determine the methods, routes and VMT of employee commutes to Benicia;	X			Add/modify language: T-8.3 [Implementation Action #1] <u>Conduct a COMMUTING AND parking study of local businesses and developments to assess the usage of existing parking lots, AND DETERMINE THE METHODS, ROUTES AND VMT OF</u>

CAP Comment Summary Table

									<u>EMPLOYEE COMMUTES TO BENICIA.</u>
83	9/01/2009	Gene Doherty	43	49	Strategy T-9.2: clarify "live-work" and "work-live".	X			<p>Add/modify language: T-9.2 [Modify title of strategy] <u>Strategy T-9.2. Live/Work AND WORK/LIVE Incentives</u></p> <p>[Modify Strategy T-9.2 language] <i>Live/work <u>AND WORK/LIVE</u> developments allow residents to live at their place of work. Reducing permit fees and expediting permitting for live/work <u>AND WORK/LIVE</u> units can encourage such developments. An additional incentive may include waiving business license fees for residents in live/work <u>AND WORK/LIVE</u> units to encourage compact development and reduce vehicle miles traveled.</i></p> <p>[Modify Implementation Action #1] <i>-Develop and adopt live/work <u>AND WORK/LIVE</u> incentives.</i></p>
84	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	44	49	Strategy T-9.3: Without a robust and consistent public initiative to gain an understanding and desire for this concept, it will fail. Add public education, thinking and planning as an on-going program and design consideration.	X			<p>Add/modify language: T-9.3 [New Implementation Action #1; add linkage and icon for Public Education and Outreach focus area] <u>-DEVELOP A ROBUST PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT</u></p>

CAP Comment Summary Table

									<u>INITIATIVE, INCLUDING EDUCATION, OUTREACH AND FACILITATED DESIGN WORKSHOPS.</u>
85	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	45	50	Strategy T-9.6: Implementation Action, add: design standards.	X			Housing units that would potentially result from implementation of this strategy would not necessarily be located in the industrial park. Therefore, design standards would default to existing standards, depending on the location of the respective project.
86	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	50	54	Existing Actions, insert "Mills" after Benicia (Mills Community Center).			X	Staff has reviewed the proposed language and the existing language and believes that the existing language adequately describes the adaptive reuse of Mills Elementary School into a community center.
87	9/14/2009	Gene Doherty	53	57	Strategy B-3.6: Implementation Action, add words: Develop and fund a wood fireplace change-out, or complete removal , program.	X			Add/modify language: B-3.6 Strategy Title: <i>Wood Fireplace Change out/REMOVAL Program</i> [Strategy 3.6 description] <i>Provide financial analysis to homeowners to change out their existing wood burning fireplaces for natural gas devices, <u>OR COMPLETELY REMOVE EXISTING WOOD FIREPLACES...</u></i> [Implementation Action #1] <i>Develop and fund a wood fireplace change-</i>

CAP Comment Summary Table

									<i>out/REMOVAL program.</i>
88	9/01/2009	Pat Donaghue (HPRC)	54	59	Why are historic structures being held to a higher standard than other structures (Strategy B-4.3 – Encourage LEED certification and/or Build It Green’s GreenPoint Rated certification for Historic Structures).			X	Staff disagrees that encouraging historic structures to obtain LEED certification and/or Build It Green’s GreenPoint Rated certification holds them to a higher standard than non-historic structures. Historic and non-historic structures will be held to the same mandatory standards.
89	8/27/2009	Mayor Patterson	55	59	Strategy B-4.5: Add Implementation Action: “add capacity to open and close windows.”	X			Add/modify language: B-4.5 [Strategy B-4.5 description] <i>Retrofit the Clocktower to achieve LEED Certification to demonstrate the City’s commitment to sustainable building practices <u>IN HISTORIC STRUCTURES. ADDING CAPACITY TO OPEN AND CLOSE THE WINDOWS, AMONG OTHER APPROPRIATE REHABILITATION MEASURES</u>, will reduce energy consumption and maintenance costs, improve indoor air quality, and serve to educate the public...</i>
90	8/27/2009	Dan Healy (PC)	59	63	Add language requiring large businesses to disclose their emissions in a public manner.		X		For subsequent consideration by the Community Sustainability Commission.
91	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	60	64	Strategy IC-1.1: Add "others" after PG&E.	X			Add/modify language: IC-1.1 [Strategy description] <i>A comprehensive building</i>

CAP Comment Summary Table

								<p><i>energy audit program should be established for industrial and commercial structures. The program should include a partnership with PG&E AND <u>OTHER RELEVANT STAKEHOLDERS</u> to promote their existing <u>NO COST</u> energy audit programs. which makes audits available at no cost to large scale energy users.</i></p> <p><i><u>Industrial and commercial audits are PG&E's PROGRAM FOR LARGE-SCALE ENERGY USERS PROVIDES COST-FREE AUDITS</u> performed by qualified engineering firms and includes...The result of implementing the measures is <u>INCREASED EFFICIENCY, DECREASED OVERHEAD,</u> AND a reduction in greenhouse gas emissions.</i></p> <p>[Implementation Actions #2, 3, 4] <i>-Develop a partnership s with PG&E AND <u>OTHER RELEVANT STAKEHOLDERS,</u> <u>WHICH INCLUDES</u> including business outreach and education programs; -Identify businesses that qualify for PG&E's EXISTING audit services PROGRAMS; -Identify businesses that qualify</i></p>
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

CAP Comment Summary Table

									<i>for PG&E's audit services PROGRAMS;</i>
92	9/14/2009	Gene Doherty	60	64	Strategy IC-1.1: Add Implementation Action: Establish an education and outreach program (or part of the audit program) for businesses, that includes energy efficiency, water conservation, waste management and the particular affects of package sizes on building HVAC requirements associated with storage of supplies and materials.	X			Add/modify language: IC-1.1 [New Implementation Action #1] <u>-ESTABLISH AN EDUCATION AND OUTREACH COMPONENT FOR BUSINESSES THAT INCLUDES BEST MANAGEMENT PRACTICES FOR ENERGY EFFICIENCY, WATER CONSERVATION, WASTE MANAGEMENT AND HEATING/VENTILATION/ AIR CONDITIONING (HVAC).</u>
93	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	60	65	Strategy IC-1.4: why have "minimum"? They contribute over 85% to carbon footprint and should have higher goal. Suggest a LEED like idea or something that is more ambitious than minimum.	X			Add/modify language: IC-1.4 [Strategy IC-1.4 description] <i>Require commercial structures to undergo minimum energy efficiency/weatherization upgrades at the time of major renovation. The definition of major renovation <u>REQUIRED UPGRADES</u> should be established by determining <u>APPROPRIATE TIERED THRESHOLDS, BASED ON CONSTRUCTION VALUATION AND/OR BUILDING ADDITION SQUARE FOOTAGE.</u> minimum construction valuation (<\$200,000) and/or building addition square foot threshold.</i>

CAP Comment Summary Table

94	9/01/ 2009	Gene Doherty	60	65	Strategy IC-1.4: Implementation Action, correct word: Adopt a commercial energy conservation ordinance.				Add/modify language: IC-4 [Implementation Action #2] -Adopt a <i>residential</i> COMMERCIAL energy conservation ordinance.
95	9/01/ 2009	Mayor Patterson	61	66	Large Emitters, add the Public Trust lands underlying pier and along shoreline. These are sovereign lands and city has stewardship responsibility.		X		Add footnote: Objective IC-3 [Footnote #28] <u>THE PIER AND SHORELINE ARE PUBLIC TRUST LANDS GRANTED BY THE STATE TO THE CITY OF BENICIA TO MAINTAIN IN TRUST FOR THE PUBLIC. THE LANDS ARE LEASED TO AMPORTS FOR USES CONSISTENT WITH THE PUBLIC TRUST DOCTRINE.</u>
96	9/14/ 2009	Mayor Patterson	62	67	Existing Actions, add at "Valero agreed via the Good Neighbor Steering Committee [delete "a"] settlement . . .	X			Add/modify language: Objective IC-4 (reformatted version) Existing Actions [4 th sentence] <i>...As a condition to the <u>REQUIRED</u> City Use Permit, which was required, Valero agreed via a <u>THE GOOD NEIGHBOR STEERING COMMITTEE</u> settlement agreement, to fund \$14,000,000 of water conservation, energy efficiency, and open space conservation projects, among other things...</i>
97	8/27/ 2009	Dana Dean	61-62	66-67	Please adjust the references to the Refinery and the Port such that it is clear that they are separate entities with distinct performance standards and objectives.			X	The formatting of Objectives IC-3 and IC-4 has been modified to disaggregate the descriptions, existing actions and strategies of the Port and

CAP Comment Summary Table

									the refinery. Objective IC-3 is now specific to the Port of Benicia and IC-4 is limited to the Valero Refinery. In doing so, the “Large Emitters” title block has been replaced with the names of the respective industrial operations.
98	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	62	67	Strategy IC-4.2: Add bullet: Work with Valero for cap and trade program. (link to State Department of Conservation)		X		For subsequent consideration by the Community Sustainability Commission.
99	9/14/2009	Dan Smith	62	67	Would like to see mandatory language for strategies related to Valero and Amports (versus voluntary)		X		For subsequent consideration by the Community Sustainability Commission.
100	8/27/2009 & 9/01/2009	Dan Healy (PC)	65	71	Add language regarding biodiesel technologies at the wastewater treatment plant.		X		For subsequent consideration by the Community Sustainability Commission.
101	8/27/2009	Mayor Patterson	66	71	Add Strategy: Adopt Ahwahnee Principles (this is actionable now since council agreed to agendize the item.		X		For subsequent consideration by the Community Sustainability Commission.
102	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	66	73	Strategy WW-1.2: Note new state law and regulations that are more liberal for graywater.	X			Add/modify language:s: Objective WW-1: Existing Actions [New last paragraph] <u><i>IN AUGUST 2009, THE CALIFORNIA BUILDING STANDARDS COMMISSION (BSC) LIFTED CALIFORNIA’S MANDATORY PERMIT REQUIREMENT FOR HOUSEHOLD GRAYWATER SYSTEMS. UNDER THE NEW</i></u>

CAP Comment Summary Table

								<p><u>REGULATIONS. RESIDENTS CAN INSTALL SMALL (UNDER 250 GALLONS PER DAY) WASHING MACHINE AND SINGLE-FIXTURE SYSTEMS WITHOUT OBTAINING A BUILDING/CONSTRUCTION PERMIT BY MEETING A LIST OF 12 CONDITIONS SET BY BSC. RESIDENTIAL SYSTEMS WITH A CAPACITY OVER 250 GALLONS PER DAY (GPD) AND INDOOR SYSYEMS STILL REQUIRE A PERMIT. HOWEVER, LOCAL JURISDICTIONS MAY CHOOSE TO EXPAND THIS EXEMPTION TO INCLUDE ALL SMALL SYSTEMS, LARGE-SCALE SYSTEMS (OVER 250 GPD), AND INDOOR SYSTEMS. FOR INDOOR SYSTEMS, LOCAL JURISDICTIONS HAVE THE ABILITY TO ESTABLISH TREATMENT STANDARDS. IN ALL CASES, THE PERMIT EXEMPTION IS LIMITED TO RESIDENTIAL APPLICATIONS.</u></p> <p>Add/modify language: WW-1.2 [Strategy title] Strategy WW-1.2. Establish Permitting Process for Graywater REUSE Systems</p>
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	---

CAP Comment Summary Table

									<p>Add/modify language: WW-1.2 [Strategy description] <i>Create a policy to support permitting and regulation of graywater systems within Benicia. Graywater systems retain water on site in underground storage for irrigation purposes, thus reducing water demand. Graywater is untreated household wastewater from bathroom sinks, showers, and bathtubs. In addition to establishing the policy, a program to inform residents about procedures for installing a system is needed. <u>ESTABLISH APPROPRIATE GRAYWATER SYSTEM PERMITTING EXEMPTIONS FOR RESIDENTIAL APPLICATIONS PURSUANT TO REGULATIONS SET BY THE CALIFORNIA BUILDING STANDARDS COMMISSION (SEE EXISTING ACTIONS).</u></i></p> <p>Add/modify language: WW-1.2 [Implementation Actions] -Establish permitting regulations for graywater systems <u>-DETERMINE APPROPRIATE PERMIT PROCESS (OR LACK THEREOF) FOR</u></p>
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	---

CAP Comment Summary Table

								<p><u>RESIDENTIAL GRAYWATER SYSTEMS:</u> <u>-DETERMINE WHAT, IF ANY, TREATMENT STANDARDS SHOULD BE ALLOWED FOR INDOOR GRAYWATER REUSE:</u> <u>-ESTABLISH AN OUTREACH PROGRAM TO EDUCATE RESIDENTS ON GRAYWATER PERMITTING STANDARDS.</u></p> <p>Add "What is graywater?" information box: <u>GRAYWATER IS UNTREATED HOUSEHOLD WASTEWATER FROM CLOTHES WASHING MACHINES, BATHROOM SINKS, SHOWERS AND BATHTUBS. GRAYWATER SYSTEMS RETAIN WATER ON-SITE FOR IRRIGATION PURPOSES, THEREBY REDUCING WATER DEMAND.</u></p>
103	9/14/2009	Gene Doherty	67	74	Strategy WW-1.6: Implementation Actions, change order: I would place the second Implementation Action "conduct fiscal ..." first in the list.		X	Prior to conducting a fiscal feasibility study, alternative solutions must be identified for analysis.
104	9/01/2009	Mayor Patterson	68	74	Strategy WW-2.1: add: purple pipe ordinance that if street is opened, purple pipe is installed (see Sonoma).		X	For subsequent consideration by the Community Sustainability Commission.
105	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	69	76	Strategy WW-3.3: Implementation Action, add: seek partners (there are regional benefits for "saving" contract water and freeing up this for environmental goals, or MI&I or	X		Add/modify language: WW-3.3 [Add new Implementation Action #1] <u>-IDENTIFY POTENTIAL PUBLIC AND PRIVATE</u>

CAP Comment Summary Table

					agriculture needs.				<u>PARTNERSHIP OPPORTUNITIES:</u>
106	9/14/2009	Pat Donaghue (HPRC)	74	71	Would like to see recycling in the Benicia Industrial Park area.	X			<p>Add new Strategy SW-2.2 [New strategy]</p> <p><u>STRATEGY SW-2.2 – CURBSIDE RECYCLING FOR INDUSTRIAL AND COMMERCIAL BUSINESSES</u></p> <p><u>A STANDARDIZED CURBSIDE RECYCLING PROGRAM FOR BENICIA BUSINESSES WOULD RESULT IN A DECREASED AMOUNT OF SOLID WASTE GOING TO THE LANDFILL.</u></p> <p>[New Implementation Action]</p> <p><u>-SURVEY BENICIA BUSINESSES TO DETERMINE APPROPRIATE LEVEL OF SERVICE:</u></p> <p><u>-ENGAGE SOLID WASTE PROVIDER(S) TO DETERMINE MOST ECONOMICAL SOLUTIONS:</u></p> <p><u>-IMPLEMENT CURBSIDE RECYCLING PROGRAM FOR BENICIA BUSINESSES.</u></p> <p>Add/modify language: Objective IC-2, ‘Business Operations’ [Objective IC-2, New last sentence]</p> <p><u>CURBSIDE RECYCLING IS</u></p>

CAP Comment Summary Table

									<u><i>AN IMPORTANT COMPONENT AND HAS BEEN ADDRESSED IN THE SOLID WASTE FOCUS AREA (STRATEGY SW-2.2).</i></u>
107	8/27/ 2009	Gene Doherty	73	85	Parks + Open Space, Adaptation, correct proper name at end of paragraph: ...Matthew Turner Park, 9th Street Park, Turnbull Park, and the Benicia State Recreation Area .			X	Add/modify language: Parks and Open Space, Adaptation [Last sentence, last location] ... <i>Sea level rise has the potential to affect existing parks adjacent to the Carquinez Strait including Matthew Turner Park, 9th Street Park, Turnbull Park, and the Benicia State Park and Recreation Area.</i>
108	9/01/ 2009	Gene Doherty	78	86	Strategy P-1.1: Add Implementation Actions: Install, with assistance from local non-profit organizations like the Master Gardeners and California Native Plant Society, a demonstration “dew pond” on a hill in the Community Park above Lake Herman. Study it to determine if sufficient water is collected to partially water the fields, if so then install irrigation. Discuss with the Benicia Unified School District the possibility of adding rain catchment (barrels or similar) apparatus to the schools to facilitate irrigating the fields. If possible then implement a solution.			X	For subsequent consideration by the Community Sustainability Commission.
109	8/27/ 2009	Mayor Patterson	78	86	Strategy P-1.1: Add: community crop (orchards) gardens for locally grown food, e.g. Sky Valley for olive trees, or regional park for community			X	For subsequent consideration by the Community Sustainability Commission.

CAP Comment Summary Table

					garden.				
110	8/27/ 2009	Dan Healy (PC)	80	85	Include metrics for calculating the amount CO2 emission reductions associated with planting individual trees.	X	X		<p>The amount of CO2 removed from the atmosphere by trees varies based on the tree species, among other factors. Therefore, staff recommends including a link of the City’s tree website to the US Forest Service carbon calculator: http://www.fs.fed.us/ccrc/topics/urban-forests/</p> <p>Add a “Did you Know” box on page 85 that references metrics associated with various amounts of trees.</p>
111	9/14/ 2009	Gene Doherty	80	88	<p>Tree Planting and Carbon Sequestration</p> <p>This section appears to have been written without the knowledge that there is a Tree Committee specifically tasked with Tree related strategies in Benicia. I am personally familiar with the recommendations that they are in the process of finalizing to present to City Council. These recommendations will cover Strategies P-4.1, P-4.2, P-5.1, P-5.2 and P-6.1, and I believe the Tree Committee could provide some better implementation steps. My concern with this section is what will become the “Policy” for Benicia, if including this section makes this the “policy” then I think we have to correct some</p>	X			<p>Add/modify language: Objective P-4, Existing Actions [Existing Actions, Second sentence] <i>...The Tree Ordinance sets regulations for TREE <u>COMMITTEE ESTABLISHES POLICY, PROGRAMS AND PRACTICES RELATED TO tree removal, alterations, and plantings...</u></i></p>

CAP Comment Summary Table

					items and bring it in line with their recommendations. If it can be worded or adopted that the Tree Committee recommendations become the “policy” then the only two changes I feel strongly about not including are relate to [Comment # 114 and #117].				
112	9/01/2009	Mayor Patterson	81	89	Amend Tree Planting discussion to recognize newly created Tree Program.			X	See analysis pertaining to Comment #111.
113	9/01/2009	Dan Healy (PC)	81	89	Add language regarding forestation as a means of cutting carbon emissions near the Valero Refinery, along freeways and Open Space.		X		For subsequent consideration by the Sustainability Commission; there are varying opinions on forestation (see comment #114).
114	9/01/2009	Gene Doherty	81	89	Regarding the “urban forest” concept for Benicia, I would be concerned about scoping this into a policy. The Tree Committee has discussed and I believe has a good understanding of the concerns of the community, public safety, maintenance costs, the environment (including carbon sequestering and reduction of air pollutants), and the life and health of the trees themselves. I would ask that they be included in any strategy/policy regarding an urban forest. For my part, I would offer that early written accounts of the landscape of Benicia identified it as “barren hills”, devoid of trees (which should not be interpreted as no trees, just seen in contrast to the oak woodlands on the other side of the		X		For subsequent consideration by the Community Sustainability Commission.

CAP Comment Summary Table

					Straits). I believe that the natural factors of Benicia require that any trees we plant be actively watered and maintained, and thus it is not a sustainable solution in and of itself. But I do agree that there is a balance that we can implement.				
115	9/14/2009	Mayor Patterson	81	89	Strategy P-4.1: Add, "Establish senior or hardship assistance to avoid tree neglect or removal and create model agreement for neighbor view protection."		X		For subsequent consideration by the Community Sustainability Commission.
116	9/01/2009	Gene Doherty	81	89	Strategy P-4.1: statement change, five to seven years is incorrectly restrictive for some species: ... Pruning should be done at appropriate intervals for the tree species to promote the health and longevity of trees.	X			Add/modify language: P-4.1 [Strategy P-4.1. Second sentence] <i>...Pruning should be done every five to seven years <u>AT APPROPRIATE INTERVALS FOR THE TREE SPECIES</u> to promote the health and longevity of trees.</i>
117	9/01/2009	Gene Doherty	81	89	Strategy P-4.2: Implementation Action, change amount: Establish and implement a tree planting program with a goal of # additional street trees. (I do not know what the # should be, I am sure the Tree Committee discussed this, and unfortunately I think 300 is a very high number target for "street trees". Please contact Mario Giuliani for more information.)	X			Add/modify language: P-4.2 [Title of strategy] Strategy P-4.2. Increase the Number of Street CITY Trees [Implementation Action #1] <i>-Establish and implement a tree-planting program with a goal of 300 additional street trees, <u>WITH PRIORITY TO STREET TREES.</u></i>
118	9/14/2009	Gene Doherty	83	See summary tables online	Conclusion Grids. The Performance Indicators column entries generally are missing the time identification component that would make them		X		Based on City Council direction, the Summary Tables have been removed from the document and have been

CAP Comment Summary Table

				<p>into metrics for Performance. So this section really needs to be beefed up in order for it to be used to set and adopt measurement goals for each Objective/Strategy. Though I think the Emissions Reduction Assumptions and Calculations document does provide another major piece to fully defining the Performance Measurements.</p>			<p>reformatted as a stand-alone matrices available on the Climate Action Plan website.</p> <p>In addition, Council has directed the Community Sustainability Commission to work with staff to review and edit the performance indicators/measures. The newly formed indicators will be added to the stand-alone table when they are completed.</p>
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--